

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA**

CHARLESTON DIVISION

**IN RE: ETHICON, INC.,
PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM
PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION**

MDL No. 2327

**THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO
ETHICON WAVE 4 CASES**

**PRETRIAL ORDER # 243
(Docket Control Order – Wave 4 Cases)**

At my request, the parties recently submitted a joint list of 400 of the oldest cases in the Ethicon MDL not already in a wave that name only the Ethicon, Inc., Ethicon, LLC and/or Johnson & Johnson (the “Ethicon defendants”) or allege claims against only the Ethicon defendants’ products. These cases, attached hereto as Exhibit A, will be known as the “Ethicon Wave 4 cases,” and it is **ORDERED** as follows:

A. SCHEDULING DEADLINES. The following deadlines shall apply in the Ethicon Wave 4 cases:

Plaintiff Fact Sheets.	11/28/2016
Defendant Fact Sheets.	12/28/2016
Deadline for written discovery requests.	01/31/2017
Expert disclosure by plaintiffs.	01/17/2017
Expert disclosure by defendants.	02/15/2017
Expert disclosure for rebuttal purposes.	03/03/2017
Deposition deadline and close of discovery.	03/17/2017
Filing of Dispositive Motions.	04/06/2017
Response to Dispositive Motions.	04/20/2017
Reply to response to dispositive motions.	04/27/2017
Filing of <i>Daubert</i> motions.	04/13/2017
Responses to <i>Daubert</i> motions.	04/27/2017
Reply to response to <i>Daubert</i> motions.	05/04/2017

1. **Discovery Completion Date.** The last date to complete depositions shall be the “discovery completion date” by which all discovery, including disclosures required by Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(a)(1), and (2), but not disclosures required by Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(a)(3), shall be completed.

2. **Limitations on Interrogatories, Requests for Admissions and Depositions.** The following limitations apply:

- a. Defendants are limited to 10 interrogatories and 10 requests for admission per plaintiff.
- b. Plaintiffs are limited to 10 interrogatories and 10 requests for admission to the Ethicon defendants.
- c. In each individual member case, no more than 4 treating physicians may be deposed.¹
- d. Depositions of plaintiff’s friends and family members may be taken at any time prior to trial provided the deposition is requested before the discovery completion date.
- e. Depositions of any witness are limited to 3 hours absent agreement of the parties.
- f. The court will consider modifications to the above limitations upon good cause shown.

3. **Limitations on Experts.** The following limitations related to experts apply:

¹ To the extent disputes arise regarding the division of time between the parties for the deposition of treating physicians (three hours total absent agreement), I will address those disputes, rather than the assigned Magistrate Judge, Judge Eifert.

- a. The parties may conduct general and specific expert discovery on the products at issue in Ethicon Wave 4. In light of the bellwether trials, Waves 1, 2 and 3 and the substantial discovery conducted to date on the Ethicon defendants' products, the parties are cautioned not to engage in duplicative general expert discovery, but instead, to tailor their discovery to the remaining Ethicon defendants' products at issue (to the extent such discovery is necessary), supplementing any discovery already completed and conducting specific causation discovery for the Ethicon Wave 4 plaintiffs. In light of the common products involved in Ethicon Wave 4, the likelihood of overlap in expert opinion from one case to another (except as to specific causation) and the need to streamline discovery in these cases, **each side is limited to no more than five (5) experts per case (exclusive of treating physicians)**. It is the court's expectation that these experts will overlap for plaintiffs who have the same product(s), to some extent, if not entirely.
- b. The parties shall coordinate the depositions of general causation experts. Insofar as multiple plaintiffs utilize the same general causation expert or experts, those experts shall be deposed only once on the issue of general causation. As to Ethicon's experts, plaintiffs are instructed to choose a lead questioner.
- c. The court encourages the coordination of depositions of specific causation experts to the extent there is overlap in the parties' use of specific causation experts for multiple plaintiffs.

d. The court will consider modifications to the above limitations upon good cause shown.

B. MOTION PRACTICE.

1. **Early Dispositive Motions.** If discovery (e.g., the deposition of plaintiff and her implanting physician) reveals facts that could support a motion that would be dispositive of the *entirety* of a plaintiff's claims (e.g., causation, the statute of limitations), either party may seek the court's leave *in the individual member case* to file an early dispositive motion on that issue. If such leave is granted, the court shall set a briefing schedule at that time.

2. **Daubert Motions.** For the filing of *Daubert* motions on general causation issues only, the parties are instructed to file one *Daubert* motion per expert in the main MDL (MDL 2327) instead of the individual member case. Each side may file one response and one reply in the main MDL to each *Daubert* motion.² This limitation does not apply to specific causation *Daubert* motions, responses and replies. Specific causation *Daubert* motions, responses and replies must be filed in the individual member cases. To the extent an expert is both a general and specific causation expert, the parties may file a general causation motion in the main MDL 2327 and an individual specific causation motion in an individual member case.

3. **Hearings.** Hearing dates for dispositive and *Daubert* motions, if any, will be set at a future status conference.

4. **Page Limitations.** The page limitations provided in Local Rule of Civil Procedure 7.1(a)(2) apply to memoranda in support of all dispositive and *Daubert* motions, oppositions, and replies, and the court will not be inclined to grant motions to exceed the page limit.

² If parties wish to adopt previous *Daubert* motions on general causation experts, they may so indicate in a filing in the main MDL 2327.

5. **Confidential Documents.** In the past, the court has permitted parties to file placeholder exhibits in support of *Daubert*, dispositive and other motions, responses and replies in the place of confidential documents that may be sealed and then, within five days, redact/dedesignate the documents or file a motion to seal. *Moving forward, the court will no longer permit this practice. Parties may no longer file placeholder exhibits.* The court expects leadership counsel for plaintiffs and the Ethicon defendants to resolve issues related to confidential designations well before the filing of motions. Filings containing placeholder exhibits will be struck. In the event there are issues related to sealing of confidential documents that the parties are unable to resolve, they must be brought to the court's attention in a consolidated manner as follows: A consolidated motion to seal is due on or before **February 9, 2017**, any response is due **February 23, 2017** and any reply is due **March 2, 2017**.

6. **Locations of Filings.** With the exception of the general causation *Daubert* motions as outlined above, the parties are reminded that they must file dispositive and *Daubert* motions on specific causation, responses and replies in the applicable member cases only, not in the Ethicon MDL.

C. CASES READY FOR TRANSFER, REMAND OR TRIAL

1. **Venue Recommendations.** By no later than **January 30, 2017**, the parties shall meet and confer concerning the appropriate venue for each of the cases, and the parties shall submit joint venue recommendations to the court by **February 9, 2017**. The parties' joint recommendation(s) shall identify the cases about which the recommended venue is in dispute. The court may then request briefing concerning the venue for those cases about which the parties disagree. Each party reserves the right to object to the venue selected by its adversary or the court.

2. **Transfer and Remand.** At the conclusion of pre-trial proceedings, the court, pursuant to PTO # 15 and 28 U.S.C. § 1404(a), will transfer each directly-filed case to a federal district court of proper venue as defined in 28 U.S.C. § 1391. In the alternative, pursuant to PTO # 15 and 28 U.S.C. § 1407, cases that were transferred to this court by the MDL panel shall be remanded for further proceedings to the federal district court from which each such case was initially transferred.³

3. **Trial Settings.** If a case is to be tried in the United States District Court for the Southern District of West Virginia (either by agreement of the parties or where venue in the Southern District is determined to be proper by the court), the case shall be deemed trial-ready when discovery is completed and the court rules on the parties' pretrial motions. The trial date for cases transferred or remanded to other federal district courts shall be set by the judge to whom the transferred or remanded case is assigned (including the undersigned through intercircuit assignment).

The court **DIRECTS** the Clerk to file a copy of this order in 2:12-md-2327 **and in the Ethicon Wave 4 cases listed on Exhibit A.** In cases subsequently filed in this district after 2:16-cv-09871, a copy of the most recent pretrial order will be provided by the Clerk to counsel appearing in each new action at the time of filing of the complaint. In cases subsequently removed or transferred to this court, a copy of the most recent pretrial order will be provided by the Clerk to counsel appearing in each new action upon removal or transfer. It shall be the responsibility of the parties to review and abide by all pretrial orders previously entered by the court. The

³ As expressly contemplated by PTO # 15, the Ethicon defendants do not waive their right to seek transfer—pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1406(a) or any other available ground—of any case to a court of proper venue, regardless of whether that case was transferred to or directly-filed in the Southern District of West Virginia.

orders may be accessed through the CM/ECF system or the court's website at www.wvsd.uscourts.gov.

ENTER: October 25, 2016



A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Joseph R. Goodwin". Below the signature, there is a horizontal line. Underneath the line, the name "JOSEPH R. GOODWIN" is printed in a standard font, followed by "UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE" in a slightly smaller font.

JOSEPH R. GOODWIN
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

EXHIBIT A

	Plaintiff(s) name	Civil Action No.
1	Swink, Lisa	2:12-cv-01290
2	Cross, Kathy & Ian	2:12-cv-02281
3	Lucas, Sue A.	2:12-cv-03025
4	Fine, Vicki R. & Howard	2:12-cv-03167
5	West, Sherrill	2:12-cv-03180
6	Young, Rose & William E., Jr.	2:12-cv-03198
7	Branaman, Connie & James	2:12-cv-03205
8	Ocker, Carol	2:12-cv-03227
9	Pruitt, Tammy & Royce	2:12-cv-03228
10	Schaffer, Stephanie	2:12-cv-03229
11	Schlosser, Joan & Anthony, Jr.	2:12-cv-03230
12	Shaner, Julie	2:12-cv-03231
13	Smith, Ethel	2:12-cv-03232
14	Soloman, Misty	2:12-cv-03233
15	Watson, Ruth & Robert	2:12-cv-03234
16	White, Emma	2:12-cv-03235
17	Heidel, Barbara & James	2:12-cv-03236
18	Dodd, Stacey & Mikell	2:12-cv-03237
19	Upchurch, Jessie	2:12-cv-03238
20	Brittain, Kay f/k/a Kay Fifield & Claire, Jr.	2:12-cv-03239
21	Heber, Jeannean & Arthur	2:12-cv-03240
22	Plahmer, Donna & Gary	2:12-cv-03241
23	Bailey, Glenda	2:12-cv-03242
24	Seto, Jewell	2:12-cv-03243
25	Harris, Tina	2:12-cv-03246
26	Webb, Wilma & Kenneth	2:12-cv-03247
27	Peters, Christy	2:12-cv-03249
28	Tharp, Iva June	2:12-cv-03251
29	Wiseman, Jeanette	2:12-cv-03252
30	Romero, Carolyn	2:12-cv-03255
31	Mullins, Deborah Jean	2:12-cv-03258
32	Borel, Sara	2:12-cv-03259
33	Bell, Charlotte	2:12-cv-03260
34	Dawson, Gloria	2:12-cv-03264
35	Altvater, Mary	2:12-cv-03265
36	Gregory, Janice & John	2:12-cv-03268
37	Justice, Brenda	2:12-cv-03285
38	Sunseri, Joyce & Louis	2:12-cv-03288
39	Goins, Sondra S.	2:12-cv-03289
40	Norris, Thelma	2:12-cv-03294
41	Spencer, Tanya	2:12-cv-03295
42	Bush, Linda Ann	2:12-cv-03298
43	Junior, Joyce	2:12-cv-03299

EXHIBIT A

	Plaintiff(s) name	Civil Action No.
44	Massengill, Melissa & Franklin	2:12-cv-03303
45	Towns, Bertha & Frank	2:12-cv-03306
46	Lunsford, Sharon Kay & Charles	2:12-cv-03308
47	Hubbard, Pamela	2:12-cv-03309
48	Todd, Peggy & Edgar	2:12-cv-03311
49	Eckdahl, Patricia A. & Peter	2:12-cv-03319
50	Brasher, Karen	2:12-cv-03324
51	Reed, Debra & Rodney	2:12-cv-03325
52	Aston, Helen	2:12-cv-03326
53	Kane, Alice Christine	2:12-cv-03365
54	Reggio, Carolyn & Sidney	2:12-cv-03367
55	Augustus, Deshawn & Charles	2:12-cv-03368
56	Chandler, Vivian	2:12-cv-03369
57	Greve, Ann	2:12-cv-03370
58	Duhe, Alice	2:12-cv-03371
59	Lyons, Marie & Marion H., III	2:12-cv-03372
60	Taylor, Marva	2:12-cv-03374
61	Gremillion, Gayle & Paul	2:12-cv-03375
62	Gutillo, Tiffany	2:12-cv-03378
63	Amie, Tina & Craig	2:12-cv-03387
64	McGee, Penny	2:12-cv-03408
65	Tumblin, Felicia & Monroe	2:12-cv-03411
66	Maurice, Estelle	2:12-cv-03415
67	Holloway, Janice M. & Martin G.	2:12-cv-03417
68	Decker, Karon & Manuel	2:12-cv-03427
69	Rogers, Monica	2:12-cv-03429
70	Anderson, Mary	2:12-cv-03437
71	Scruggs, Peggy & William	2:12-cv-03439
72	Coleman, Priscilla & Elmer Richardson	2:12-cv-03440
73	Banks, Orelia	2:12-cv-03441
74	Mayes, Tammy M.	2:12-cv-03463
75	Baksic, Danielle & Brian	2:12-cv-03536
76	Cupp, Joyce A. & Carmen	2:12-cv-03547
77	Conley, Maglenda & Ray	2:12-cv-03548
78	Whitehead, Rebecca & Randall	2:12-cv-03552
79	Saylor, Katie & Jason	2:12-cv-03553
80	Lester, Mary E.	2:12-cv-03560
81	Herbert, Jane L. & William	2:12-cv-03568
82	Mullins, Lottie M. & Darrell	2:12-cv-03577
83	Watkins, Kitty M. & Larry	2:12-cv-03578
84	Glass, Beverly & William	2:12-cv-03579
85	Steiner, Annie & Phillip	2:12-cv-03580
86	Marrero, Ada & Gary	2:12-cv-03581

EXHIBIT A

	Plaintiff(s) name	Civil Action No.
87	Harvell, Rita	2:12-cv-03586
88	Eversole, Debbie	2:12-cv-03593
89	Vanover, Sherry & Lawrence	2:12-cv-03594
90	Himes, Carolyn	2:12-cv-03595
91	Farrar, Lunda E.	2:12-cv-03596
92	Smith, Betty & Carl	2:12-cv-03597
93	Clark, Addie	2:12-cv-03598
94	May, Bethany & Jimmy	2:12-cv-03602
95	Snow, Joyce & Christopher	2:12-cv-03603
96	Deakins, Lucille & Donald	2:12-cv-03605
97	Riffle, Kimberly A. & Michael	2:12-cv-03611
98	Robinson, Michelle & Bobby, Jr.	2:12-cv-03612
99	Neal, Glendora	2:12-cv-03614
100	Johnson, Pamela F. & James	2:12-cv-03615
101	Cox, Patty & Raymond	2:12-cv-03616
102	Horton, Barbara & Michael	2:12-cv-03641
103	O'Neill, Kary	2:12-cv-03642
104	Boettner, Brenda	2:12-cv-03643
105	Jucha, Anna M.	2:12-cv-03646
106	Hogue, Nancy & Ernest	2:12-cv-03679
107	Sales, Dorothy Jean & Millard	2:12-cv-03682
108	Borden, Rose	2:12-cv-03692
109	Kramer, Catherine M. & James R.	2:12-cv-03696
110	Champion, Joyce & Charles	2:12-cv-03723
111	Staton, Toni	2:12-cv-03724
112	Davis, Terri & Daniel	2:12-cv-03726
113	Hampton, Zona & Glen	2:12-cv-03727
114	Ball, Shannon & Darius	2:12-cv-03728
115	Bynum, Rachel & Randall	2:12-cv-03729
116	Bodah, Carole Ann	2:12-cv-03733
117	Datz, Lillian & Kerry M.	2:12-cv-03735
118	White, Jessica & Jeremy	2:12-cv-03736
119	Orr, Cindy & Allen	2:12-cv-03738
120	Thompson, Harriet & Bertram	2:12-cv-03741
121	Adkins, Lori & William Preston Martin	2:12-cv-03751
122	Harris, Jennie L.	2:12-cv-03781
123	Kerley, Lisa & K. Lynn	2:12-cv-03786
124	McKay, Kara	2:12-cv-03807
125	Clark, Gloria J. & James R.	2:12-cv-03833
126	Elliott, Sandra L. & John W.	2:12-cv-03834
127	Ratledge, Lori L. & Edward F.	2:12-cv-03835
128	Arceneaux, Cherie & Scott	2:12-cv-03840
129	Gross, Theresa	2:12-cv-03842

EXHIBIT A

	Plaintiff(s) name	Civil Action No.
130	Ashburn, Regina	2:12-cv-03843
131	Turner, Melanie	2:12-cv-03847
132	Beckstead, Cicily & Jeffery	2:12-cv-03849
133	Hollingsworth, Melanie W.	2:12-cv-03850
134	Ammons, Lynn C. & Thomas B.	2:12-cv-03853
135	Thornwall, Lorna G.	2:12-cv-03854
136	West, Susan D.	2:12-cv-03855
137	Collins, Melissa D. & Charles	2:12-cv-03866
138	Blankship, Tina & Shelby	2:12-cv-03867
139	Bird, Gladys	2:12-cv-03869
140	Thacker, Connie J.	2:12-cv-03870
141	Jackson, Cynthia & William	2:12-cv-03871
142	Keller, Linda	2:12-cv-03872
143	Knox, Frances M. & Thomas	2:12-cv-03873
144	Wooten, Melissa G. & John	2:12-cv-03874
145	Vance, Lisa R. & Christopher S.	2:12-cv-03886
146	Happel, Wendy B. & John M.	2:12-cv-03889
147	Burlison, Shirley Ann	2:12-cv-03893
148	Christian, Kathy	2:12-cv-03894
149	Francis, Steven A., as personal representative of the Estate of Debbie Jean Francis, Deceased	2:12-cv-03895
150	Jelks, Mary A.	2:12-cv-03896
151	Kelley, Peggy & Elton	2:12-cv-03897
152	Hodge, Vivian L.	2:12-cv-03898
153	Holden, Shirley	2:12-cv-03899
154	Hutson, Glena D.	2:12-cv-03900
155	Jolly, Shelia L.	2:12-cv-03901
156	Dill, Diane S. & Lawrence Wayne	2:12-cv-03914
157	Kitts, Mary Ruth (Allman)	2:12-cv-03916
158	Leach, Rhonda Lea	2:12-cv-03917
159	Ouzts, Connie Melissa	2:12-cv-03918
160	Flowers, Lisa & Keith	2:12-cv-03922
161	Wimberly, Sharon Marie	2:12-cv-03932
162	Ruiz-Lambert, Tamara	2:12-cv-03938
163	Bates, Dana & Charles	2:12-cv-03939
164	Mays, Crystal Mae & Harold	2:12-cv-03942
165	Zollman, Gloria & Terry	2:12-cv-03951
166	Rasch, Joan Marie	2:12-cv-03952
167	Guichard, Blanche	2:12-cv-03955
168	Camanga, Dolores Ann	2:12-cv-03957
169	Stewart, Juanita & Benny	2:12-cv-03958
170	Culbertson, Edna & Thomas, Jr.	2:12-cv-03970
171	Howard, Ella Jean & John Aubrey, Sr.	2:12-cv-03976

EXHIBIT A

	Plaintiff(s) name	Civil Action No.
172	Duet, Deniese & Bob	2:12-cv-03988
173	Brugier, Bernadette & William Ray	2:12-cv-03989
174	Glenn, Kim F. & Timothy J. Brown	2:12-cv-03996
175	Galarza, Delia	2:12-cv-03998
176	Courville, Vanessa & Troy	2:12-cv-03999
177	Chapman, Cheryl Annette	2:12-cv-04001
178	Alexander, Cathy L.	2:12-cv-04002
179	Moses, Christine Wilder & Robert	2:12-cv-04005
180	Armstrong, Jill Victoria	2:12-cv-04025
181	Connolly, Peggy & Gregory	2:12-cv-04026
182	Morningstar, Wyonne K. & Robert	2:12-cv-04038
183	Heady, Tammy Jo	2:12-cv-04040
184	Secord, Estelle & Paul	2:12-cv-04042
185	Boyd, Betty & Richard	2:12-cv-04047
186	Lloyd, LaSedar M. & Mark S.	2:12-cv-04061
187	Oglesby, Robin	2:12-cv-04062
188	Sally, Wanda C. & Robert	2:12-cv-04065
189	Stephens, Patricia	2:12-cv-04081
190	Jenkins, Tina & Randy	2:12-cv-04082
191	Taylor, Elizabeth & Robert	2:12-cv-04083
192	Hopper, Sherry	2:12-cv-04084
193	Baker, Terri Lyn	2:12-cv-04085
194	Vanderpool, Ortha	2:12-cv-04087
195	Lowery, Margie & John	2:12-cv-04092
196	Melton, Rebecca & Arthur	2:12-cv-04094
197	Thomas, Deanna	2:12-cv-04095
198	James, LaJoyce & Jesse	2:12-cv-04096
199	Benz, Christine	2:12-cv-04097
200	Dano, Autumn & Larry	2:12-cv-04100
201	Thaté, Connie F. & Steven C.	2:12-cv-04144
202	Armstrong, Bernadine	2:12-cv-04168
203	Humbert, Anne	2:12-cv-04170
204	Alvarado, Jeanette	2:12-cv-04196
205	Rhoads, Marjorie Juanita	2:12-cv-04243
206	Spoon, Edna M. & William S.	2:12-cv-04245
207	Jenkinson, Rebecca	2:12-cv-04246
208	Schmidt, Lou Ann	2:12-cv-04248
209	Toole, Sharon Adams	2:12-cv-04249
210	Zeagler, Linda & Roy	2:12-cv-04250
211	Biel, Frances & John	2:12-cv-04254
212	Batis, GeorgeAnn & John Steven	2:12-cv-04257
213	Carbon, Ediany & Albert	2:12-cv-04269
214	Bartley, Sharon & Larry D.	2:12-cv-04270

EXHIBIT A

	Plaintiff(s) name	Civil Action No.
215	Kaifler, Barbara & Bruce	2:12-cv-04271
216	Ragusa, Mary Jo	2:12-cv-04272
217	Adipietro, Ann D.	2:12-cv-04281
218	Patterson, Beverly & Donald	2:12-cv-04282
219	Franks, Keri S. & Harvey L.	2:12-cv-04283
220	Cortes, Blanca & Larry Richardson	2:12-cv-04284
221	Riegert, Debra	2:12-cv-04287
222	Perkins, Carol	2:12-cv-04328
223	Griffin, Tamika	2:12-cv-04331
224	Peshewa, Melanie & Macaki	2:12-cv-04332
225	Blades, Nancy & Wayne	2:12-cv-04349
226	Hahn, Kathleen K.	2:12-cv-04364
227	Christopherson, Verla M.	2:12-cv-04365
228	Schmitt, Lori J. & Paul A.	2:12-cv-04379
229	Hart, Debra Ann & Walter J.	2:12-cv-04411
230	Herold, Melissa & Matt	2:12-cv-04412
231	Tarver, Anna Lynn	2:12-cv-04428
232	Fields, Angela B.	2:12-cv-04473
233	Lewis, Sandra	2:12-cv-04474
234	Ray, Darla	2:12-cv-04475
235	Price, Leigh A. & Douglas	2:12-cv-04476
236	Wang, Gloria & Donald E. Wakeman	2:12-cv-04477
237	Sheldon, Christine & Michael	2:12-cv-04508
238	Crete, Teresa L. & Kyle	2:12-cv-04509
239	Boess, Jennifer H. & Jamie	2:12-cv-04510
240	Wade, Mary F. & Forrest	2:12-cv-04512
241	Fredenburg, Carol & Oliver	2:12-cv-04513
242	Euans, Audrey J. & Brad	2:12-cv-04514
243	Browley, Stephanie Q. & Marcus Johnson	2:12-cv-04515
244	Gracon, Pamela M. & Lawrence	2:12-cv-04516
245	Raymond, Julie & James	2:12-cv-04541
246	Thomson-Roy, Jeannae M.	2:12-cv-04586
247	Tedeschi, Phyllis	2:12-cv-04588
248	Ferrer, Brooke	2:12-cv-04591
249	Nevel, Mary L. & Thomas	2:12-cv-04645
250	Breeden, Candy S.	2:12-cv-04658
251	Poland, Nyla S.	2:12-cv-04659
252	Sparkman, Sheridan Sheryl	2:12-cv-04671
253	Wurtz, Julieann & Bruce	2:12-cv-04679
254	Decuir, Sabrina	2:12-cv-04727
255	Fox, Cynthia & Lonnie M.	2:12-cv-04755
256	Alfred, Lula	2:12-cv-04756
257	Messick, Linda & Marlin	2:12-cv-04757

EXHIBIT A

	Plaintiff(s) name	Civil Action No.
258	Blough, Cathy & Mark	2:12-cv-04758
259	Norris, Tina	2:12-cv-04759
260	Kern, Sharon & Raymond	2:12-cv-04760
261	Funk, Sharon	2:12-cv-04761
262	Doane, Rebecca Jane	2:12-cv-04763
263	Boswell, Courtney Lynette	2:12-cv-04770
264	Gomez, Celia	2:12-cv-04776
265	Petsch, Adrienne	2:12-cv-04778
266	Sobie, Pamela & Raymond	2:12-cv-04789
267	Reeves, Sarah	2:12-cv-04790
268	Smith, Barbara & Gary	2:12-cv-04791
269	Schalk, Julie K. & Ron	2:12-cv-04806
270	Paul, Claudine & Jack Gary	2:12-cv-04808
271	Humphrey, Charlotte & Allen C., III	2:12-cv-04810
272	Taylor, Brenda L.	2:12-cv-04811
273	Kimsey, Cathy & Christopher	2:12-cv-04814
274	Thorpe, Tina Darlene	2:12-cv-04822
275	Beltran, Alba G. & Manuel	2:12-cv-04824
276	Goggins, Judy & Marshall	2:12-cv-04827
277	Collins, April & Paul	2:12-cv-04828
278	Janus, Rosemary	2:12-cv-04830
279	Lynch, Margaret & James	2:12-cv-04832
280	Cross, Vicki Ann	2:12-cv-04836
281	Buie, Phyllis Darlene	2:12-cv-04838
282	Eddington, Rosalei May	2:12-cv-04839
283	Gaffield, Trisha & Kevin	2:12-cv-04843
284	Gaines, Jackie L.	2:12-cv-04844
285	Hall, Teresa & Brian	2:12-cv-04846
286	Hodge, Tammie Jean & Jerry	2:12-cv-04847
287	Hopper, Sarah & William	2:12-cv-04848
288	Jefferson, Edna Marie	2:12-cv-04849
289	Green, Karen & Curtis	2:12-cv-04851
290	Barnes, Margaret A. & Clarence A.	2:12-cv-04853
291	Cox, Brenda	2:12-cv-04854
292	Johnson, Crystal & Jonathan W.	2:12-cv-04856
293	Malone, Jeanette & Ronald Dean	2:12-cv-04903
294	Duncan, Debbie & Danny	2:12-cv-04904
295	Brown, Judy & Jerry	2:12-cv-04906
296	Hall, Teresa	2:12-cv-04915
297	Thurman, Gladys	2:12-cv-04930
298	Strunk, Sandy & Charles	2:12-cv-04933
299	Piquette, Anna	2:12-cv-04934
300	Mellody, Marilyn & Martin	2:12-cv-04936

EXHIBIT A

	Plaintiff(s) name	Civil Action No.
301	Presley, Wanda	2:12-cv-04945
302	Fahlberg, Barbara & Herbert Joe	2:12-cv-04946
303	Custer, Charlotte & Kelly Michael	2:12-cv-04948
304	Tucker, Diana & Carl	2:12-cv-04958
305	Burns, Deborah	2:12-cv-04963
306	Carino, Jessamyn Rebekah & Frankie	2:12-cv-04966
307	Childress, Shirley	2:12-cv-04971
308	Valverde, Cecilia & Robert	2:12-cv-04991
309	Pirlein, Adelheid	2:12-cv-04992
310	Crook, Sandra Jordan	2:12-cv-04998
311	Crespin, Tawnya	2:12-cv-05004
312	Schwartz, Lauren & Jon	2:12-cv-05009
313	Murphy, Cynthia	2:12-cv-05012
314	Wollitz, Cindy & John	2:12-cv-05013
315	Husted, Stacy & Kenneth	2:12-cv-05024
316	Lewis, Sharon Gail & Earl	2:12-cv-05026
317	Martin, Mary Elizabeth	2:12-cv-05028
318	Paape, Sarina Catherine & Rickey	2:12-cv-05029
319	Pascual, Mary	2:12-cv-05032
320	Wall, Patti Ann & A. Dwayne	2:12-cv-05034
321	McCoy, Lesa Gail	2:12-cv-05040
322	Birchfield, Sheila & Dennis	2:12-cv-05053
323	Slemp, Rita G.	2:12-cv-05056
324	Moore, Jennifer & Ronald	2:12-cv-05084
325	Geisinger, Melinda P.	2:12-cv-05112
326	Sullivan, Ladonna & Myron	2:12-cv-05113
327	Thornton, Betty	2:12-cv-05115
328	Rizer, Renae Lynn	2:12-cv-05128
329	Coppinger, Mary & Robert	2:12-cv-05129
330	Ronquille, Rebecca & Blane	2:12-cv-05132
331	Bertel, Brenda C. & Lanny	2:12-cv-05136
332	Ermold, Ruth	2:12-cv-05137
333	Gibson, Connie Sue & Jesse Willis	2:12-cv-05142
334	Huffstetler, Jane & Charles	2:12-cv-05150
335	Riddle, Dawn Ann	2:12-cv-05166
336	Anders, Shelby	2:12-cv-05168
337	Lewis, Tammy & James	2:12-cv-05169
338	Creager-Awichi, Sharon	2:12-cv-05184
339	Miller, Roxanna D. & Tony R. Kingery	2:12-cv-05185
340	Cox, Shirley & Randall	2:12-cv-05191
341	Gibbons, Shirley J.	2:12-cv-05216
342	Vieth, Judith A.	2:12-cv-05228
343	West, Peggie	2:12-cv-05236

EXHIBIT A

	Plaintiff(s) name	Civil Action No.
344	Howe, Cynthia A. & Fred	2:12-cv-05237
345	Shaw, Carol	2:12-cv-05239
346	Waterman, Doris	2:12-cv-05253
347	Roman, Jeanette	2:12-cv-05255
348	Winston, Cynthia & Alfred W., Jr.	2:12-cv-05256
349	Hartwig, Deborah M. & Douglas	2:12-cv-05257
350	Spada, Jamie	2:12-cv-05258
351	Robles, Gwendolyn	2:12-cv-05266
352	Trump, Ruth Kash & Jeffrey	2:12-cv-05267
353	Garcia, Maria	2:12-cv-05279
354	Strauss, Candace & Troy	2:12-cv-05280
355	Smith, Teresa & Dwaine	2:12-cv-05305
356	Zaccardi, Cindy & Thomas	2:12-cv-05312
357	Martin, Kirsten & Roger	2:12-cv-05334
358	Stahl, Judy M.	2:12-cv-05340
359	Stepski, Zinaida	2:12-cv-05342
360	Comstock, Margaret H. & Roger	2:12-cv-05345
361	Church, Lucinda & Samuel	2:12-cv-05359
362	Smith-McDuffie, Katherine & Samuel	2:12-cv-05379
363	Stensgard, Janet	2:12-cv-05389
364	Hooten, Leota	2:12-cv-05392
365	Martin, Darlene & Glenn	2:12-cv-05394
366	Smith, Elizabeth B.	2:12-cv-05395
367	Whipple, Christine & Douglas	2:12-cv-05402
368	Jenkins, Robileen & Jerry	2:12-cv-05405
	Fincher, William, Administrator of the Estate of Latricia	
369	Fincher, deceased	2:12-cv-05406
370	Moore, Samantha L. & Larry C.	2:12-cv-05412
371	Harden, Terri	2:12-cv-05413
372	Blum, Marsha Ann	2:12-cv-05428
373	Furgason, Stacie & Jacky	2:12-cv-05441
374	Erickson, Jennifer & Corey	2:12-cv-05462
375	Warman, Doretta M.	2:12-cv-05463
376	Valencia, Jasmine	2:12-cv-05475
377	Bernhardt, Florence	2:12-cv-05476
378	Bowers, Deborah	2:12-cv-05477
379	Martinek, Esther	2:12-cv-05478
380	Cottrell, Tammy & Rand A.	2:12-cv-05480
381	Bowman, Lynn M. & Bradley	2:12-cv-05485
382	Brown, Ana Maria & Manford	2:12-cv-05488
383	Cockman, Martha & Ray	2:12-cv-05504
384	Ledezma, Brenda & Alipio	2:12-cv-05505
385	Cress, Wilma & Danny Lee, Jr.	2:12-cv-05512

EXHIBIT A

	Plaintiff(s) name	Civil Action No.
386	Sloan, Penny	2:12-cv-05515
387	Newton, Cynthia D. & Robert A.	2:12-cv-05517
388	Cisek, Donna	2:12-cv-05521
389	Coake, Hope	2:12-cv-05523
390	Cox, Jennifer	2:12-cv-05526
391	Dorsey, Cinnamon	2:12-cv-05528
392	Duffy, Sharon	2:12-cv-05529
393	Cotton, Debbie	2:12-cv-05530
394	Raney, Glenda & Gary	2:12-cv-05551
395	Jones, Beverly & Greg	2:12-cv-05555
396	Kirkland, Bernice	2:12-cv-05569
397	Hollaway, Martha & Robert A.	2:12-cv-05572
398	Robinson, Carol A.	2:12-cv-05573
399	Ferrell, Ann & Cecil	2:12-cv-05593
400	Draper, Amy L.	2:12-cv-05594